

28. A growing dilemma: English speaking anxiety-in-EFL classrooms: A review of research

Devrim HÖL¹

Yusuf KASIMI²

APA: Höl, D. & Kasımi, Y. (2022). A growing dilemma: English speaking anxiety-in-EFL classrooms: A review of research. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, (28), 421-438. DOI: 10.29000/rumelide.1132581.

Abstract

The current study aims to discuss the current situation of research on speaking anxiety of EFL learners through some variables. The journals indexed in various databases were searched and 59 studies were selected for the review by considering (a) the participant selection process of the studies (b) the main causes of speaking anxiety in EFL classrooms (c) whether there is any difference according to some variables including level of proficiency, gender, and English learning background (d) how the participants perceive themselves in terms of speaking anxiety. It was found that the number of studies on speaking anxiety has been on the increase in the last decade. When it comes to the causes of speaking anxiety in the bunch of studies, the foremost and most reported cause of speaking anxiety is learners' fear of making mistakes, being compared by others, proficiency level and gender type. As speaking one of the four skills to communicate in any language, it is important to find solutions to these questions and enhance the development of the EFL learners' speaking skills. The findings yield important insights on Turkish EFL learners speaking anxiety in English for all the stakeholders ranging from teachers and learners. In addition, it is hoped that, from the sociological perspective, this paper will pave a way to rethink and criticize the local context in countries which do not include oral exams in their national standardized testing system and mandate receptive skills.

Keywords: English as a foreign/second language, language learning, speaking anxiety, systematic review

Yabancı dil sınıflarında İngilizce konuşma kaygısı üzerine bir derleme çalışması

Öz

Bu çalışma, temel olarak yabancı dil olarak İngilizce öğrenen öğrencilerin konuşma kaygısının mevcut durumunun bazı değişkenler açısından tartışmayı amaçlayan bir derlemedir. Farklı veri tabanlarında indekslenen dergiler taranmış ve inceleme için 59 çalışma seçilmiştir. Bulgular konuşma kaygısı üzerine yapılan çalışma sayısının son on yılda artmakta olduğunu ortaya koymaktadır. Bulgular, Türkiye'deki öğretmenler, kurumlar, program geliştiriciler ve öğrencilerden oluşan tüm paydaşlar için Türkiye'deki yabancı dil olarak İngilizce öğrenen öğrencilerin konuşma kaygısı konusunda önemli bilgiler vermektedir. Konuşma kaygısının en çok bildirilen nedenleri, öğrencilerin hata yapma ve başkalarıyla kıyaslanma korkusu, yeterlilik düzeyleri ve cinsiyet türleridir. Bu çalışmanın amacı (a) çalışmaların katılımcı seçim sürecini (b) yabancı dil olarak İngilizce öğretimi

¹ Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Pamukkale Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi, İngiliz Dili Eğitimi ABD (Denizli, Türkiye), devrmpau@gmail.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0001-5151-2581 [Araştırma makalesi, Makale kayıt tarihi: 04.04.2022-kabul tarihi: 20.04.2022; DOI: 10.29000/rumelide.1132581]

² Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Düzce Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi, İngiliz Dili Eğitimi ABD (Düzce, Türkiye), yusufkasimi@duzce.edu.tr, ORCID ID: 0000-0003-0613-8812

sınıflarında konuşma kaygısının temel nedenlerini (c) yeterlilik düzeyi, İngilizce öğrenme geçmişi ve cinsiyet de dâhil olmak üzere bazı değişkenlere göre bir fark olup olmadığını (d) katılımcıların konuşma kaygısı açısından kendilerini nasıl algıladıkları bulmaktır. Herhangi bir dilde iletişim kurmak için kullanılan dört beceriden biri konuşma becerisi olduğu için, bu sorulara çözüm bulmak ve yabancı dil olarak İngilizce öğrenen öğrencilerin konuşma becerilerinin gelişimini sağlamak gerçekten önemlidir. Bu yazının kurumlara, araştırmacılara, öğrencilere, öğretmenlere ve müfredat tasarımcılarına yabancı dil sınıflarında konuşma kaygısı konusunda farkındalık kazanmaları ve öğrenmeyi geliştirmeye yardımcı olan sınıflarda daha rahat bir ortam yaratmalarına yardımcı olacağına inanılmaktadır.

Anahtar kelimeler: İkinci/yabancı dil olarak İngilizce öğrenme, konuşma kaygısı, sistematik derleme

Introduction

There is no doubt that we live in a world that is changing rapidly and in a highly influential way. With all these developments around the globe, communication has gained priority in academics and in each field of a professional context. Since English is widely used as a way of global communication, EFL learners' English-speaking skills must be enhanced in relation to other skills in reading, listening, and writing. Speaking in the target language has become as important as or more important than other skills such as reading, listening, and writing, and it, as the primary tool for conveying messages in the target language, enables students to produce in the target language. While doing so and trying to produce orally in English, they may have some considerations, the most important of which is “speaking anxiety”, so speaking is considered as the primary anxiety-provoking element of foreign and second language education (Marzec-Stawarska, 2015: 116). It is also clear that there is a strong relationship between the anxiety level and achievement in learning a foreign language (Horwitz et.al., 1986: 2). In classes and the general context of teaching English, teachers and learners have concerns in common; most of the students have high levels of anxiety in speaking in the target language. In general, anxiety, which is one of the most common emotions, has always been a focus of research in foreign language teaching. Learning a foreign language is always associated with some level of tension and uneasiness (Shomoossi, 2009: 2), however, anxiety in communicating in a second language, particularly in English, can have an adverse effect on their learning and may influence learners' learning and motivation to the atmosphere of the target language and, finally, their educational aims (Mohamad & Wahid, 2009: 1). Taking all concerns mentioned above, the researchers seek to answers to the following research questions;

1. What kind of causes of speaking anxiety in the EFL/ESL setting are presented in the studies published?
2. What are the demographic characteristics including gender, proficiency level, and the background of the participants in the studies published?
3. What are the self-perceptions of EFL learners on speaking anxiety?

Purpose of the study

In the present study, the systematic review of speaking anxiety may provide some important insights for teachers, institutions, policymakers, curriculum designers as well as teachers and it is important to reveal whether studies conducted on speaking anxiety in Turkey are satisfactory, or what the general

Adres
RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi
Osmanağa Mahallesi, Mürver Çiçeği Sokak, No:14/8
Kadıköy - İSTANBUL / TÜRKİYE 34714
e-posta: editor@rumelide.com
tel: +90 505 7958124, +90 216 773 0 616

Address
RumeliDE Journal of Language and Literature Studies
Osmanağa Mahallesi, Mürver Çiçeği Sokak, No:14/8
Kadıköy - ISTANBUL / TURKEY 34714
e-mail: editor@rumelide.com,
phone: +90 505 7958124, +90 216 773 0 616

perception of speaking anxiety in Turkey in terms of EFL learners, what the general descriptors of speaking anxiety are for learners' fear of making mistakes, proficiency level and gender.

Relevant literature

Language Anxiety

Foreign language learning could be a very challenging process for some language learners. There is a variety of explanations for this difference associated with some cognitive and affective factors in language learning. These factors include motivation, personality, aptitude, intelligence, learner styles, and strategies (Ellis, 2008: 79). Anxiety is one of these factors which has always been a significant problem that many students experience in the foreign language learning process. It has been revealed that students experience anxiety in language classes more compared to other classes such as history or maths. (Horwitz et al. 1986; Muchnik & Wolfe 1982, MacIntyre & Gardner 1989 cited in Cutrone 2009) On the other hand, anxiety has been studied for many years by researchers and as a result of all these studies there are different perspectives on anxiety in general, but mostly it has been associated with psychology. Spielberger's definition of anxiety is "subjective, consciously perceived feelings of apprehension and tension, accompanied by or associated with activation or arousal of the autonomic nervous system". (cited in Wilson, 2006: 1). Similarly, Horwitz et al. (1986) also defined anxiety as a "subjective feeling of tension, apprehension, nervousness, and worry" (cited in Carreira, 2006: 125). Such psychological definitions are mostly related to negative feelings and emotions such as tension, fear, or worry. Language anxiety is a specific type of anxiety that is correlated with L2 learning context. MacIntyre (1998) defines anxiety as an emotional reaction or worry that occur in the process of learning or producing a second language. (cited in Riasati, 2011). Horwitz et al. (1986:128) mention language anxiety as "a distinct complex of self-perceptions, beliefs, feeling, and behaviors arising from the uniqueness of the language learning process. (cited in Alghothani, 2010). Similarly, MacIntyre and Gardner (1993, cited in Alghothani 2010) define language anxiety as "the apprehension experienced when a situation requires the use of a second language with which the individual is not fully proficient" (p. 5). Thus, language anxiety can be defined as emotional feelings or reactions of learners that they show in their language learning process.

Effects of Anxiety on Learning

The relationship between foreign language learning and language anxiety has been a main focus of research for many years because it is one of the factors that might impede success in language learning. MacIntyre and Gardner (1991, cited in Kondo n.d.) view anxiety as one of the best obstacles to achievement in a second language. A number of studies (Gardner, 1985; Gardner, Tremblay & Magoret, 1997) have revealed a high correlation between anxiety and language proficiency. (Kondo, n.d.). These correlations are both positive and negative. Therefore, researchers haven't been able to reach a clear consensus on the effect of anxiety on learning. Some of the research suggests that a certain amount of anxiety can enhance learners' performance in the classroom. (Scovel, 1978, cited in Cutrone 2009). In another study, Kleinmann (1977) found that facilitating anxiety helped students to take more risks and use the normally avoided structures such as passive forms. (Alghothani, 2010). Krashen (1982) is also one of the researchers who believe the strong relationship between anxiety and language acquisition. He believes that low level of anxiety helps language acquisition, because it doesn't influence affective filter negatively. Thus, a certain degree of language anxiety can have facilitating effects on language learning. Although there have been stated some positive effects of language anxiety on learning, foreign/second

language learning anxiety has mostly been associated with negative effects. Campbell and Ortiz (1991, p. 159) considered the levels of anxiety among university students to be “alarming” and indicated that one-half of all language learners experience negative consequences of foreign language learning anxiety (cited in Subaşı, 2010). These negative effects can be classified as physical, psychological, or social (e.g., Bailey, Daley, Onwuegbuzie, 1999; Oxford 1999a; cited in Andrade & Williams 2009). Physical effects irregular heartbeat, muscle tension and can include excessive sweating. Psychological effects may be shame, anxiety and fear. The social effects of anxiety include reluctance to communicate and avoidance, and so on. All of these effects are caused by high degrees of anxiety and as a result of this, learners usually display poor performance or fail. MacIntyre and Gardner (1989: 27) claimed that “anxiety leads to deficits in learning and performance (cited in Wilson 2006). Similarly, Kondo and Ling (2004) stated that learners with high level of anxiety might have problems such as difficulty in understanding and low level of production. Some of the studies have found out that anxiety influences learners’ communication strategies in language classes. In a study, Ely (1986, cited in Cutrone 2009) stated that learners with feelings of anxiety had less attempts to take risks in the language class. In brief, a result of all the studies carried out on the correlation between anxiety and foreign language learning is that it can be claimed that anxiety can contribute to learners’ success or failure in language depending on some factors.

The Causes of Anxiety

There have been different theories about the causes of anxiety in language classes. One theory is that language anxiety is caused by poor foreign language performance resulting from native language ability and foreign language learning aptitude of the learner (e.g., Sparks & Ganschow, 1991; Ganschow & Javorsky, Sparks, Skinner, Anderson, & Patton, 1994). Sparks and his colleagues have carried out a number of studies trying to find out whether foreign language anxiety is a cause or a consequence of differences in students’ language learning skills, especially their native language learning skills and foreign language aptitude (cited in Alghothani, 2010). Sparks and Ganschow (1991: 10) suggested the Linguistic Coding Differences Hypotheses (LCDH) which claimed that “foreign language learning, being an attempt to learn language, is enhanced or limited by the degree to which students have control over the phonological, syntactic, and semantic components of the linguistic code” (Alghothani, 2010). Another theory about the causes of foreign language anxiety is about situational variables such as course activities, level, instructor, and organization (Jackson, 2002; Oh, 1992; Oxford, 1999a; Powell, 1991; Samimy, 1989; Spielmann & Radnofsky, 2001; Young, 1991, cited in Andrade & Williams 2009). Another area of research focused on learner variables as source of anxiety such as learner beliefs, age, learning styles and strategies etc. (e.g., Bailey, Daley, & Onwuegbuzie, 1999; Brown, Robson, & Rosenkjar, 1996; Campbell, 1999; Dewaele, 2002; Ehrman & Oxford, 1995; Gardner, Day, & MacIntyre, 1992; Gardner, Smythe, & Brunet, 1977; Gregersen & Horwitz, 2002; Oxford, 1999b, cited in Andrade & Williams 2006). According to Horwitz et al. (1986) foreign language anxiety may stem from three performance anxieties which are communication apprehension (e.g. shyness about communicating with people, difficulty in understanding the teacher’s instructions), fear of negative evaluation (fear of making mistakes, fear of correction, losing face in front of others) and test anxiety (fear of failing the class). (Tanveer, 2007). Young (1991) also suggested another group of potential sources of language anxiety. She discusses six potential sources from three aspects: the learner, the teacher and the instructional practice. She claimed that language anxiety results from a) personal and interpersonal anxieties; b) instructor beliefs about language teaching; c) learner beliefs about language learning; d) language testing; e) classroom procedures and f) instructor-learner actions. (Riasati, 2011).

Language Anxiety and the Speaking Skill

Speaking skill is probably the most anxiety-provoking language skill in many language classes (Keremida, 2009 cited in Subaşı, 2010). Learners generally consider participating in speaking activities as highly anxious. Horwitz et al. (1986) called the anxiety of second language performance “communication apprehension”. It occurs when learners have difficulty in communicating with others although they may have sufficient cognitive skills. Communication apprehension defines situations when students could not comprehend a message, input, instruction or when they fear the act of speaking. Daly (1991, cited in Wilson 2006) stated that some learners “fear of giving a speech in public exceeded such phobias as fear of snakes, elevators and heights” (p.3). There are some features of foreign language speaking anxiety that can be perceived in learners experiencing anxiety. For example, learners generally cannot reproduce the intonation and rhythm of the language, pronounce the words; when they are called on, they freeze up, forget what they will say or cannot find the right word, or they remain silent (Young, 1991; cited in Wilson 2006). There could be a variety of factors causing learners to experience these situations. According to Horwitz et al. (1986, cited in Wilson 2006) learners who are afraid of making mistakes in front of others “seem to feel constantly tested and perceive every correction as a failure” (p.130). Another reason could be classroom activities and the learning/teaching environment. Young (1990, cited in Wilson 2006) stated that majority of his university level and high-school learners of Spanish felt less uncomfortable in speaking activities when they were “prepared” and when they were “not the only person answering a question” (p.544).

Analysis of the Selected Research Studies

This section of the paper examines speaking anxiety of the selected articles published between the years 2000 and 2019 October. Summaries of the 59 articles include the title, year, indexing, journal, author(s), research questions, subjects, data collection instruments, and the results of speaking anxiety are obtained.

Method

The Manuscript Selection Process

Table 1. Distribution of Document Types in Studies Published

Document Types	N
Research Article	50
Conference Proceedings	9

A systematic review is a type of literature review that seeks to identify the evidence which is available on a topic (Booth & Papaioannou, 2016). In this study, previous studies focusing on Speaking Anxiety in Foreign Language (FLSA) were considered. In this study, all journals between the years 2000 and October 2019 indexed in all databases are searched and collected. 100 studies are reviewed and 41 of them were omitted as they were not related to the aim of the study. Indexed journals including ERIC (12), PROCEDIA (6), SCOPUS (3), Taylor and Francis Online (2), COPERNICUS (7), Canadian Center of Science and Education (3), RedFame (2), Crossref (5), Macrothink Institute (2), IJELS(3), BASE (2), DOAJ (2), SOBIAD (1), Global Challenge (1), Dergipark (1), ERICPLUS (1), EBISCO (3), Association of Applied Linguistics (1), SciLit (1), De Gruyter (1), ASIAN TEFL (1), American Center of Science and

Education (1), IAAJS (1), JEELS (1), DRJI (2), SINTA (1), SIEC (1), SAGE (1), UPM(1), ESCI (1) are examined.

Table 2. Distribution of Data Analysis Types

Data Analysis Type	N
Quantitative	33
Qualitative	9
Mixed	12
Teacher Observation	5

In the present study, content analysis process was applied. Content analysis helps us to get a systematic and objective means to yield reliable data in many ways to reveal and qualify specific evidence (Downe-Wambolt, 1992). In qualitative content analysis, as data are presented in sentences, themes, and words, it makes it possible to interpret the results (Berg, 2001). For the first research question, the type of participants was classified into three groups: a) primary and secondary schools, b) higher education students enrolled in college or university c) not specified (a study in which the type of the participants is not defined). For the second research question, it is found that proficiency level and age take a large place among the other causes of speaking anxiety such as self-perception and gender. The third research question seeking an answer about the range of proficiency level students have. It is found that, almost half of the participants in these studies are taking preparatory classrooms which means their proficiency levels are between A1 and C1. For the fourth research question, students' self-perception on speaking anxiety was analyzed and it is indicated that students suffer from their lack of vocabulary and grammar structures. The most encountered problem which causes bad conclusions on students' speaking abilities is their fear of making mistakes. They are not confident enough to performance because of the possibility of being criticized by their peers. For the fifth research question, specifying whether gender enhance the speaking anxiety or not was the main aim. It is concluded that mostly female students more tend to get anxious than males when speaking English language. Alongside of these results, some studies showed that there is no connection between gender and speaking anxiety. In the sixth research question, it is examined whether students' background effects their speaking performance or not. It is found that students have difficulty in their speaking performances because they could get enough English education on their previous classes. It is also seen that lack of experience and practice were unable to cope for students who are supposed to speak in English just as their peers. Studies have shown that qualitative data collection methods such as interviews and observations are the most commonly employed, and these techniques are further supported by content analysis and other case studies. Some research uses a combination of methodologies. The employment of exclusively quantitative approaches in research is quite uncommon, but in order to strengthen the validity of the research, triangulation should be used. For this reason, researchers should employ a variety of data collection methods (qualitative as well as quantitative) in order to get accurate results. Twelve studies on the comparative evaluation of English language teacher education programs are evaluated in this study. They were published in seven prestigious journals between 2008 and 2018. The assessment finds a dearth of comparative research on language teacher education programs. Once the articles in this review's corpus are analyzed according to their research methodologies, it is discovered that qualitative studies outweigh mixed-method and quantitative method studies. Seven out of twelve investigations adopt a qualitative approach. The reason qualitative research methodologies have gained popularity appears to be connected to the kind of data gathering technologies used in program assessment studies. Given that the studies involve evaluating English language teacher education programs, gathering stakeholder perspectives and assessing

program materials are often favored. While four of them employ a combination of methods, only one is entirely quantitative. In terms of data gathering methods, it can be stated that interviews, surveys, policy and curriculum papers, essays, and field notes are recommended. Interviews stand out among these data gathering methods since they are employed in 10 out of twelve research.

Results and discussion

RQ1: What kind of causes of speaking anxiety in EFL/ESL setting are presented in the studies published in terms of different variables?

Table 3. Distribution of Studies in Terms of Causes

Causes of English Language Speaking Anxiety	Studies Published
Lack of Self Confidence	Öztürk & Gürbüz (2014), Şubaşı (2010), Toköz Göktepe (2013), Tok (2009), Kayaoğlu & Sağlamlı (2013), Ölmezler Öztürk & Ok (2014), Yaman(2016), Coşkun (2016), Hamzaoğlu & Koçoğlu (2016), Amorim (2013), Tridinanti (2018), Heryatun & Tarihoran (2016), Anwari (2019), Sayuri (2016), Ariyanti (2016), Akkakoson (2016), He (2013), Woodrow (2006), Kasap & Power (2019), Takkaç Tulgar (2018), Baharuddin & Rashid (2014), Gopang et Al., (2015), Bensalem (2017), Melouah (2013), Barabas (2013)
Age & Proficiency	Çağatay (2015), Alcı et Al. (2016), Gürsoy & Akın (2013), Tercan & Dikilitaş (2015), Gürsoy & Korkmaz (2018), Debrelı & Demirkan (2015), Liu (2006), Bozkırlı (2019), Abrar (2017), Lian & Budin (2014)
Achievement Stress	Tuncer & Doğan (2015), Yaman(2016), Demirdaş & Bozdoğan (2013), Dalkılıç (2001), Wilang & Singhasiri (2017), Sutarsyah (2017), Woodrow (2006), Baharuddin & Rashid (2014), Melouah (2013)
Feedback Problem	Tuncer & Doğan (2015), Tercan & Dikilitaş (2015), Han et Al. (2016), Çakıcı (2016), Aydoğan et Al. (2014), Akkakoson (2016), Sadighi & Dastpak (2017), Sayuri (2016), Melouah (2013)
Gender	Çağatay (2015), Öztürk & Gürbüz (2012), Tercan & Dikilitaş (2015), Demirdaş & Bozdoğan (2013), Tien (2018), Sharifi & Lashkarian (2015), Toghraee & Shahrokhi (2014), Gopang et Al. (2015), Lian & Budin (2014)
Background	Yaylı (2012), Gürsoy & Korkmaz (2018), Mede & Kararımak (2017), Bozkırlı (2019), Akkakoson (2016), Rafada & Madini (2017), Batiha (2016), Gopang et al., (2015)
Unpreparedness	Öztürk & Gürbüz (2014), Yalçın & İnceçay (2013), Tercan & Dikilitaş (2015), Genç et Al. (2016), Batiha (2016), Bensalem (2017), Barabas (2013)
Negative Evaluation	Öztürk & Gürbüz (2014), Şubaşı (2010), Toköz Göktepe (2013), Kayaoğlu & Sağlamlı(2013), Elaldı (2016), Amorim (2013), Sadighi & Dastpak (2017), Tien (2018), Akkakoson (2016), Mulyono et Al. (2019), Heryatun & Tarihoran (2016), Anwari (2019), Hosni (2014), Kasap & Power (2019), Batiha (2016), Takkaç Tulgar (2018), Baharuddin & Rashid (2014), Bensalem (2017), Melouah (2013), Lian & Budin (2014), Barabas (2013)

Proficiency Level and Age

In this study, it is observed that effects of proficiency level and age gains an important place on FLSA. Studies shows that the higher proficiency level students have, the more anxious they feel. In addition, some studies stated that there is no relationship between proficiency and anxiety.

Çağatay (2015) indicated that there was not considerable difference at the level in FLSA scores for beginner, elementary, intermediate, and upper-intermediate students. Similarly, Karataş et al. (2016) noticed that the language level does not affect students' levels of foreign language speaking anxiety. On the contrary, Aydın et al. (2017) indicated that higher grade students seem more anxious at the time of testing and unexpected questions, when compared to lower grade students just as Debreli and Demirkan (2015) who mentioned the results of the test that was conducted to compare the elementary and pre-intermediate students' anxiety level. Coming to the influence of age, both the youngest and the oldest students suffer from failing in tests and exams in English according to Aydın et al.' study (2017). The study by Gürsoy and Korkmaz (2018) revealed significant variations in English language classroom anxiety between freshmen and seniors. Given that teacher candidates graduate from high schools with minimal or no exercise in speaking activities and an insufficient capacity to communicate in a second language, the first year of university when all courses need second language output, may increase their anxiety levels. The students' levels of speaking anxiety appears to decrease during the course of their university education. Gürsoy and Akın (2013) found that being younger may be better for learning a foreign language. Debreli and Demirkan (2015) reported that pre-intermediate level students' anxiety level is higher than elementary level students' anxiety. In addition, Dalkılıç (2001) indicated that there was a positive relationship between the students' anxiety levels and their speaking performance success levels in speaking classes, on the contrary, Liu (2006) added; the more proficient students are likely to be less anxious.

Self-Perception

Self-perception is one of the major factors causing FLSA. In the studies investigating the causes of FLSA, self-perception is considered and mostly found a negative relationship between self-perception and FLSA. Subaşı (2010) stated if a student trusts his abilities, he will not be anxious at the time of his performance. In other words, if he believes that he did not have the required skills to ensure success in the speaking lessons, he could suffer from foreign language speaking. Similarly, because of high expectations from their speaking performance in the speaking lessons and not being able to supply those expectations as anticipated, students suffer from FL speaking anxiety. Likewise, students who perceive their English level as "poor" are more anxious to speak in public classrooms than the other students perceiving their English level as "Very Good, Good, Ok." Tok (2009). With a similar example, Mede and Kararmak (2017) reported that there was a negative correlation between English self-efficacy and foreign language speaking anxiety. Aydoğan et al. (2014) pointed out lack of self-confidence is in moderate, positive correlation with Intention for practicing English and in negative correlation with Beliefs about speaking English. So, when someone is not confident enough, he will have smaller intentions and motivation for practicing English, but also have more inadequate beliefs about speaking English. According to Sadighi & Dastpak (2017), the three primary reasons of learners' anxiety are "anxiety of making mistakes," "anxiety of being assessed adversely," and "poor word recognition." According to Heryatun and Tarihoran's (2016) study, speaking anxiety is caused by a variety of factors, ranging from students' self-confidence to their surroundings and behaviour aspects. According to Anwari (2019), students are concerned about making errors and the prospect of being judged by other

peers in the classrooms. According to Sharifi and Lashkarian's (2015) study, there is no notable difference in speaking among different genders. According to Sayui (2016), students struggle with a lack of self-esteem, humiliation, fear of making errors, nervousness, and nothing on their mind to say. Furthermore, some students avoid participation out of fear of being wrong and a lack of self-esteem confidence and desire, tend to prefer to remain quiet in classroom (Ariyanti, 2016). Students think of making mistakes when speaking in front of their peers which is very embarrassing for them (Hosni, 2014). Rafada and Madini (2017) mentioned that there are few causes 1- Test Anxiety 2- Lack of Vocabulary Knowledge 3- Inefficient Education at Schools 4- Teachers' Role in Raising or Reducing Anxiety 5- Peer Anxiety. In Melouah's study (2013), it is indicated that foreign language speaking anxiety was common among first year LMD students and appeared to mostly result from language proficiency fear of interaction, low self-confidence, error correction and self-esteem, etc. According to Baharuddin and Rashid (2014), university ESL students had a moderate anxiety level. Anxiety in English classes, skills of communication, anxiety of adverse assessment, and test anxiety were identified as significant causes to participants' speaking anxiety.

Achievement

Nearly all of the studies found a negative relationship between FLSA and achievement. In other words, the higher level of anxiety meant the higher level of failure. Students who have great level of proficiency is supposed to reach achievement, so they get anxious in case they can't meet these expectations.

Demirdaş and Bozdoğan (2013) are pointing out that as the level of anxiety increases, the language success decreases. In the same way, Dalkılıç (2001) stated that there was a positive correlation between the students' anxiety levels and their success levels in speaking classes. In Tuncer and Doğan's (2015) study, it was seen that the students' anxiety was counted as an academic failure with speaking anxiety in the language class dimension and it predicted academic success with the interest in the language class dimension. According to Çakıcı (2016), the relationship between FLCAS scores and language achievement was found to be negative, indicating that language success decreased as anxiety level increased. In other words, these findings indicate that it is associated with low academic achievement of high levels of language anxiety. Similarly, Hamzaoğlu and Koçoğlu (2016) indicated that there was a negative relationship between the participants' speaking performance and anxiety; Despite the growing concern in this case the participants' speaking indicates that decreased performance of speaking.

Gürsoy and Korkmaz (2018) showed considerable differences between freshmen and seniors in terms of foreign language speaking anxiety. The level of speaking anxiety may decrease lower as the participants get more practice in their university education. Not being confident enough and not speaking in lessons anxiety can be grouped as educational, individual and environmental. Individual reasons can be explained as not being close to the target language, lack of self-confidence and fear of making mistakes are more dominant than the others which results in students see English as a phenomenon that they haven't had experience and trying to convey themselves through this unaware manner as a basic cause for speaking anxiety. Speaking in front of other students and expected responses to an individual's speech performance are the main causes of speaking anxiety (Öztürk & Gürbüz, 2014). Most of the students blamed their language because it was limited to vocabulary and grammar structures. Main reasons behind this problem may be about having low level of language and/or content knowledge and appreciable affective and individual factors (ToközGöktepe, 2013). One of the problems that the students have mentioned is preparedness vs. unpreparedness (Yalçın&İnceçay, 2013). Feeling of making a mistake while talking in the target language increases our anxiety and it is dissuasive (Şenel,

2012). Tridinanti (2018) indicated that the higher the self-confidence, the higher the speaking achievement. With the similar results, Sutarsyah (2017) stated that students with low level of speaking anxiety got better grades on their speaking test than those who have high level of speaking anxiety. Abrar (2017) reported that competence variable is the most important factor to predict the change in foreign language speaking anxiety.

RQ2: What are the demographic characteristics including gender, proficiency level, and the background of the participants in the studies published?

Table 4. Participation Types in Studies Published

Participation Type	N
High School Students	5
Prep-Class Students	6
Undergraduate Students	44
Undergraduate Students and Teachers	4

When the selection of participants for the studies on EFL speaking anxiety is concerned, it is certain that the number of studies has constantly increased in the last decade. When the participant selection process of the studies is considered, participants are mostly students at a university and frequently the ones attending English Language Teaching (ELT) department or English Preparatory School.

Although the majority of the studies on speaking anxiety are conducted in colleges or universities, many studies focused on speaking anxiety in primary and secondary schools. ToközGöktepe (2013) analyzed the group includes 120 students enrolled in a public school. In another study, the convenience sampling technique was used, and a total of 150 students participated in the study. 77 participants were 8th grade students ranging in age from 13 to 14 (Gürsoy&Karaca, 2018). The participants in the study were 494 Turkish children students who taking lessons on English as a foreign language at primary and secondary schools (Aydın et al., 2017). The study was managed at a vocational high school (Satar&Özdener, 2008). The participants were 84 children who were given EFL lessons in a state primary school (Gürsoy&Akın, 2013). Participants in Coşkun's (2016) study were 293 high school students. Hamzaoğlu and Koçoğlu's (2016) study consisted of students in two ninth-grade classes. Without considering which education they take; some participants are selected with the knowledge of their proficiency level.

When the qualities of participants who took part in the studies, all of them is Turkish which means, all of them know Turkish as a mother tongue. They were all taught English with Turkish Educational System but maybe some of them attended English course with their individual choice.

To determine and understand the causes of FLSA, questionnaires are given to the students. Besides, interviews are done with students, who have more potential to be anxious than others according to the questionnaire in Gürsoy and Korkmaz's (2018) study, the interviewees were chosen among the participants having higher speaking anxiety. More studies should be conducted with larger samples in various contexts.

The Proficiency Level of EFL Learners in the Studies Published

Proficiency level can be defined as a factor that decreases students' speaking achievement. In the studies analyzed, it is seen that mostly, the higher proficiency level students have, the more anxious they

become, so it is aimed to investigate students' proficiency levels. Öztürk and Gürbüz's (2014) study consists of 383 students. Students were placed in English language preparatory classrooms with the grades of language achievement test (Han et al., 2016). The participants were 331 A1 students (Demirdaş&Bozdoğan, 2013). Koçak (2010) indicated that students' English level is lower-intermediate, and their mother tongue is Turkish.

In studies conducted, mostly (41,1 %), participants attend preparatory classrooms.

The participants of the Öztürk and Gürbüz's (2014) study included 383 university students in the English preparatory classrooms. In the other study, the participation of students was 320 (Karataş et al., 2016). The participants included 314 EFL students at the English preparatory program of a state university (Öztürk& Ok, 2014). Tuncer and Doğan (2015) stated that it was required for students to take a FL achievement test before they could start education in their departments. The results of the Elaldi's (2016) study were evaluated for 98 participants. The study was handled at Preparatory School (Tercan&Dikilitaş, 2015). The total number of participants were 33. They were placed in A1 level English language preparatory classrooms through a placement test year (Han et al., 2016). Yaman (2016) stated that the participants were all attending prep classes. The participants of the study were 301 students attending an EFL preparatory classrooms (Çakıcı, 2016). The participants were 331 A1 (beginner to elementary) students attending an EFL preparatory school at a state university. (Demirdaş&Bozdoğan, 2013). 100 students have participated in Aydoğan et al.' study (2014). 196 students of the total 350 enrolled in the English Preparatory School voluntarily participated in Debreli and Demirkan's study (2015). Students have been studying at the English Preparatory School for four semesters (Koçak, 2010).

Gender and Speaking Anxiety in EFL Context

Gender is always found as one of the important factors which causes speaking anxiety in EFL classrooms. In the previous studies it was mostly mentioned that female learners more tend to get anxious than male learners.

In the studies conducted, it can be clearly seen that gender has a significant effect on EFL learners' speaking anxiety. According to the studies analyzed, the results show that female learners are more anxious in speaking to a greater part (54.5 %). Çağatay (2015) stated that female students at seem to be more anxious in terms of foreign language speaking anxiety. Female students showed a moderate level of anxiety, while male students experienced low level of anxiety. (Öztürk& Gürbüz, 2012). Female students have more anxiety than male students (Tercan&Dikilitaş, 2015). Female students are much more anxious than male students, according to Çakıcı's (2016) results. Additionally, according to Demirdaş and Bozdoan (2013), female students are much more anxious than males. Female teacher candidates experience greater anxiety than male teacher candidates under four circumstances: speaking with any preparation beforehand preparations; speaking with native english speakers; speaking once their names are mentioned; and speaking around other teacher candidates (Gürsoy& Korkmaz, 2018). Female students are more anxious about speaking English than male classmates (Tien, 2018). The results of Lian and Budin's (2014) study revealed that students have an average level of English language anxiety and there is a considerable difference between genders in English language anxiety.

On the other hand, alongside of findings which shows female students are more anxious than male, a part (more than a quarter) of studies say the opposite.

In a study, Tok (2009) pointed that females are less anxious and more willing to performance speaking in English classes than males. Similarly, Aydın et al. (2017) stated that female students are more confident of tests in English, while male learners feel less worried during test preparation. According to Elaldi's (2016) study, male students are more likely to feel anxious and they are worried about making mistakes in language classes.

Apart from these, there are some studies indicating that gender does not affect the FLCA (in nearly one-fifth of the studies). The results of Gürsoy and Karaca's (2018) study indicate that there was no considerable difference according to gender regarding students' speaking efficacy beliefs and speaking anxiety). With the similar meaning, Köksal et al. (2014) pointed that Those who learn a foreign language may be concerned to some speaking anxiety independent of gender. It was indicated that female and male learners are similar in terms of foreign language anxiety in terms of Köksal et al.'s study (2014). There was no considerable difference observed between male and female learners in terms of anxiety level (Sharifi & Lashkarian,2015). In Batiha and Noor et Al.'s (2016) study, it is certain that there are no significant gender differences found in terms of foreign language speaking anxiety factors. It was found that no considerable difference was found in language anxiety between male and female students (Gopang et Al., 2015).

Background of EFL Learners

Most studies support the impact of EFL learners' background:

EFL students acknowledged that their anxiety negatively affected their current learning and that many of them blamed their previous learning experiences for the anxiety they had in public speaking classes (Yaylı, 2012). Participants stated that they suffered from anxiety because they did not have enough opportunity to practice in their previous education (Koçak, 2010). Additionally, it is reported that students in Turkey do not have enough opportunities to speak in target language, which causes them to feel anxious and confused when asked to speak in English in the classroom. As a consequence, it was concluded that the Turkish educational system did not adequately prepare learners to communicate in English (Gürsoy& Korkmaz, 2018). Bozkırlı (2019) concluded that speaking anxiety significantly changes in positive or negative way depending on their grade and speaking experience. Akkakoson (2016) reported that having ineffective background may be one of the reasons which hinders speaking development.

RQ3: What are the self-perceptions of EFL learners on speaking anxiety?

Most of the students blamed their language because it was limited to vocabulary and grammar structures. Main reasons behind this problem may be about having low level of language and/or content knowledge and appreciable affective and individual factors (ToközGöztepe, 2013). One of the problems that the students have mentioned is preparedness vs. unpreparedness (Yalçın&İnceçay, 2013). Participants consider culture as the one of the main causes of speaking anxiety. According to the majority of participants, their lack of knowledge about English culture hinders them from speaking English (Coşkun, 2016). Students worry that they speak English in class and even stated that the feelings of anxiety and tension negatively affects motivation and self-confidence. (Öztürk&Gürbüz, 2012). In Toghraee and Shahrokhi's (2014) study, it was mentioned the main sources of language anxiety were speaking in front of classmates, concern about grades, and worry about being lost in class. In addition,

results indicated that there was a significant negative relationship between students' level of anxiety and their test scores.

One of the most important issues to be handled here could be the fear of making mistakes. Most students see language as a tool for communication. For this purpose, a nuisance to fall, because they believe that the participants in vain attempts in such a situation. In Kayaođlu and Sađlamel's (2013) study, a number of learners stated that they were afraid of making mistakes. According to Amorim's (2013) study, the students were worried about speaking because they were worried about producing correct English, fear of underperformance and fear of negative evaluation, and shyness to speak in front of their classmates. Students reported feelings of unease, feelings affecting their self-esteem and bodily sensations associated with anxiety (Kasap& Power, 2019).

Discussion and conclusion

This integrative study review was carried out in order to comprehend the results of previous research and also the main elements of research on speaking anxiety. These 59 studies published between the years 2000 and October 2019 were selected, categorized, analyzed in a systematic way, and yielded some important conclusions. The first implication is that Turkish EFL learners have a high level of anxiety on speaking English as a second language, so it should be taken into consideration that students need more practice on speaking skills in English. As a suggestion, teachers should allocate more time on speaking in English. Focusing on productive skills in EFL classrooms through some activities would yield positive results in lowering the anxiety on speaking in the target language. As a suggestion, Yüce (2018) stated that listening to music in foreign/second language can be helpful for students to overcome their anxiety. Similarly, Cesur (2020) suggests that adapting and using magic could motivate young learners to improve their speaking skills. The program to improve their speaking skills can be revised to eliminate the anxiety on speaking English as a foreign language and all stakeholders should keep in mind that anxiety affects the performance of learners in a negative way. Another reason for the high level of anxiety may be "the ignorance of speaking skills" in EFL classes. The testing system both in-class and local context may lead to this problem and receptive skills may gain more importance compared to productive skills. As an example, a relatively small number of studies on speaking anxiety of Turkish EFL learners reveal that it is a neglected research area for researchers. Secondly, the teaching programs can be examined to find out whether they include enough speaking activities and time allocated is satisfactory to improve the speaking skills of Turkish EFL learners. To wrap up, a comprehensive modification is a must in speaking-in-the-target-language classes and teachers can be equipped and supported with activities to improve the speaking skills of learners, so the review here also implies there may be a need to include and modify a variety of speaking activities in terms of pedagogy, and pedagogical applications of the curricula for pre- and in-service teachers. Future studies may also focus on teachers' experiences on planning, practicing, evaluating, and giving feedback on speaking skills of learners, so pre- or in-service trainings may be needed for teachers to be practical, effective, and enjoyable in implementing planning and practicing speaking activities in their classes. Furthermore, future research could also investigate the relationship between teacher identity, motivation, experience, and teaching practices on speaking skills in Turkey. This present study tries to provide a detailed and useful data about the studies and give an overall perspective on speaking anxiety. It is hoped that this present study will be helpful for all the stakeholders ranging from institutions, researchers, teachers to find out the causes and overcome speaking anxiety in EFL classes.

References

- Abrar, Mukhlash. (2017). An Investigation into Indonesian EFL University Students' Speaking Anxiety. *Journal of English Education and Linguistics Studies*, 4, 93-120. DOI: 10.30762/jeels.v4i2.358
- Akcan, S., Aydın, B., Karaman, C., Korkmazgil, S., Özbilgin, A., Seferoğlu, S., & Selvi, A. F. (2015). "Expectations of Stateholders in Higher Education Sector from ELT Job Applicants". Paper presented at the Association for Teacher Education in Europe (ATEE) 40th Annual Conference 2015: Teacher Education through Partnerships and Collaborative Learning Communities, University of Glasgow, Glasgow, UK, August, 2015.
- Akkakoson, S. (2016). Speaking Anxiety in English Conversation Classrooms among Thai Students. *Malaysian Journal of Learning and Instruction*, 13(1), 63-82. DOI: 10.32890/mjli2016.13.1.4
- Akkakoson, Songyut. (2016). Reflections from teachers and students on speaking anxiety in an EFL classroom. *Journal of Language and Cultural Education*, 4, 10.1515/jolace-2016-0025. DOI: 10.1515/jolace-2016-0025
- Al Hosni, S. (2014). Speaking difficulties encountered by young EFL learners. *International Journal on Studies in English Language and Literature (IJSELL)*, 2(6), 22-30.
- Alghothani, D. (2010). Foreign language anxiety in an intermediate Arabic reading course: A comparison of heritage and foreign language learners (Doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University).
- Amorim, R. M. (2013). Transforming Passive Listeners into Active Speakers: A Study with Portuguese Undergraduates in "English for the Social Sciences". *English Language Teaching*, 6(4), 110-119. DOI: 10.5539/ELT.V6N4P110
- Andrade, M., & Williams, K. (2009). Foreign language learning anxiety in Japanese EFL university classes: Physical, emotional, expressive, and verbal reactions. *Sophia Junior College Faculty Journal*, 29(1), 1-24.
- Anwari, A. (2019). Investigating the Causes and Negative Effects of English Language Speaking Anxiety: A Case Study among EFL Learners at Kandahar University. *American International Journal of Education and Linguistics Research*, 2(2), 10-21. DOI: 10.46545/AIJELR.V2I2.77
- Ariyanti, A. (2016). Psychological factors affecting EFL students' speaking performance. *ASIAN TEFL Journal of Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, 1(1). DOI: 10.21462/ASIANTEFL.V1I1.14
- Aydın, S., Harputlu, L., Celik, S. S., Ustuk, O., & Guzel, S. (2017). Age, gender and grade effect on foreign language anxiety among children. *TEFLIN Journal*, 28(2), 133-154. DOI: 10.15639/TEFLINJOURNAL.V28I2/133-154
- Aydoğan, H., Akbarova, A. A., Doğan, A., Gonen, K., Tuncdemir, E., & Kerla, M. (2013). I can understand but cannot speak": Language anxiety for oral communication. *Global Challenge*, 1(2), 17-30.
- Baharuddin, S. S., & Rashid, S. M. (2014). English language learning anxiety and oral performance among undergraduate ESL learners. *Journal of Language and Communication*, 1(2), 137-154.
- Barabas, C. D. (2013). Investigating ESL university students' language anxiety in the aural-oral communication classroom. Unpublished master's thesis, University of San Carlos, Cebu City, Philippines.
- Barbara Downe-Wamboldt RN, PhD (1992) Content analysis: Method, applications, and issues, *Health Care for Women International*, 13:3, 313-321, DOI: 10.1080/07399339209516006
- Batiha, J., Noor, N. M., & Mustaffa, R. (2016). Speaking Anxiety among English as a Foreign Language Learner in Jordan: Quantitative Research. *International Journal of Education and Research*, 4, 63-82.
- Bensalem, E. (2017). Exploring Foreign Language Anxiety among English-Major Undergraduate Students = استكشاف قلق المرئطن تعلم اللغة الأجنبية لدى الطلاب المتخصصين في اللغة الإنجليزية. *Journal of the North for Humanities*, 327(3789), 1-14. DOI: 10.12816/0031340

- Berg, B. L. (2001). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon. DOI: 10.2307/1317652
- Booth, A., Sutton, A., and Papaioannou, D. (2016). *Systematic approaches to a successful literature review*. Sage.
- Bozkırlı, K. Ç. (2019). An Analysis of the Speaking Anxiety of Turkish Teacher Candidates. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 7(4), 79-85. DOI: 10.11114/jets.v7i4.4060
- Çağatay, S. (2015). Examining EFL students' foreign language speaking anxiety: The case at a Turkish state university. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 199, 648-656. DOI: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.07.594
- Cakici, D. (2016). The Correlation among EFL Learners' Test Anxiety, Foreign Language Anxiety and Language Achievement. *English Language Teaching*, 9(8), 190-203. DOI: 10.5539/elt.v9n8p190
- Campbell, C. M., and Ortiz, J. (1991). Helping students overcome foreign language anxiety: A foreign language anxiety workshop. *Language anxiety: From theory and research to classroom implications*, 153-168.
- Carreira, J. M. (2006). Motivation for learning English as a foreign language in Japanese elementary schools. *Jalt journal*, 28(2), 135. DOI: 10.37546/JALTJJ28.2-2
- Cesur, K. (2020). The Use of Magic Card Tricks in Teaching English to Young Learners . *Trakya Eğitim Dergisi* , 10 (1) , 263-275 . DOI: 10.24315/tred.582738
- Coskun, A. (2016). Causes of the " I Can Understand English but I Can't Speak" Syndrome in Turkey. *Journal on English Language Teaching*, 6(3), 1-12. DOI: 10.26634/jelt.6.3.8174
- Cutrone, P. (2009). Overcoming Japanese EFL learners' fear of speaking. *Language studies working papers*, 1, 55-63. DOI: 10069/28554
- Dalkılıç, N. (2001). The role of foreign language classroom anxiety in English speaking courses. *Çukurova Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 8(8).
- Debreli, E., & Demirkan, S. (2015). Sources and levels of foreign language speaking anxiety of English as a foreign language university students with regard to language proficiency and gender. *International Journal of English Language Education*, 4(1), 49-62. DOI: 10.5296/ije.v4i1.8715
- Demirdağ, Ö., & Bozdoğan, D. (2015). Foreign Language Anxiety and Performance of Language Learners in Preparatory Classes. *Turkish Journal of Education*, 2(3). DOI: 10.19128/turje.181060
- Elaldi, S. (2016). Foreign Language Anxiety of Students Studying English Language and Literature: A Sample from Turkey. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 11(6), 219-228. DOI: 10.5897/ERR2015.2507
- Ellis, R. (2008). Learner beliefs and language learning. *Asian EFL Journal*, 10(4), 7-25.
- Espinoza, S., & Gabriela, M. (2019). "Analysis of self-efficacy and anxiety effects on the speaking skill development at novenoaño de educación básica "a" at unidateducativa "capitánedmundochiriboga" in the city of riobamba, chimborazo province, in the academic term 2018-2019" (Bachelor's thesis, Riobamba).
- Ganschow, L., Sparks, R. L., Anderson, R., Javorshy, J., Skinner, S., & Patton, J. (1994). Differences in language performance among high-, average-, and low-anxious college foreign language learners. *The Modern Language Journal*, 78(1), 41-55. DOI: 10.2307/329251
- Genc G., Kuluşaklı E. & Aydın S. (2016). Foreign language speaking anxiety and anxiety coping strategies employed by Turkish EFL learners. *Proceedings of ICERI2016 Conference*, 417-423. DOI: 10.21125/iceri.2016.1105. DOI: 10.21125/iceri.2016.1105
- Gopang, I. B., Bughio, F. A., & Pathan, H. (2018). Investigating foreign language learning anxiety among students learning English in a public sector university, Pakistan. *MOJES: Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 3(4), 27-37.

- Gopang, I. B., Umrani, T. H., Bughio, F. A., & Lohar, S. (2015). English speaking anxiety: A study of undergraduate students of English. *International Researcher, International Researchers* 4(1), 54-61.
- Gürsoy, E., & Akin, F. (2013). Is younger really better? Anxiety about learning a foreign language in Turkish children. *Social Behavior and Personality: an international journal*, 41(5), 827-841. DOI: 10.2224/sbp.2013.41.5.827
- Gursoy, E., & Korkmaz, H. (2018). Speaking anxiety of freshmen and senior ELT prospective teachers. *Eğitimde Kuram ve Uygulama*, 14 (1), 48-60 . DOI:10.17244/eku.346886
- Hamzaoğlu, H., & Koçoğlu, Z. (2016). The application of podcasting as an instructional tool to improve Turkish EFL learners' speaking anxiety. *Educational Media International*, 53(4), 313-326. DOI: 10.1080/09523987.2016.1254889
- Han, T., Tanrıöver, A. S., & Sahan, Ö. (2016). EFL Students' and Teachers' Attitudes toward Foreign Language Speaking Anxiety: A Look at NESTs and Non-NESTs. *International Education Studies*, 9(3), 1-11. DOI: 10.5539/ies.v9n3p1
- He, Deyuan. (2013). What makes learners anxious while speaking English: A comparative study of the perceptions held by university students and teachers in China. *Educational Studies*. 39. DOI:10.1080/03055698.2013.764819
- Horwitz, E.K., Horwitz, M.B., & Cope, J.T. (1986). Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70(2), pp. 125-132. DOI: 10.2307/327317
- Karatas, H., Alci, B., Bademcioglu, M., & Ergin, A. (2016). An Investigation into University Students' Foreign Language Speaking Anxiety. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 232, 382-388. DOI: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.053
- Kasap, S. & Power, K. M. (2019). Anxiety in the EFL Speaking Classrooms. *The Journal of Language Teaching and Learning*, 9(2), 23-36.
- Kayaoğlu, M. N., & Sağlamel, H. (2013). Students' perceptions of language anxiety in speaking classes. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, 2(2), 142-160. DOI: 10.7596/TAKSAD.V2I2.245
- Kleinmann, H. H. (1977). Avoidance behavior in adult second language acquisition 1. *Language learning*, 27(1), 93-107. DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-1770.1977.tb00294.x
- Koçak, M. (2010). A novice teacher's action research on EFL learners' speaking anxiety. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 3, 138-143. DOI: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.07.025
- Köksal, O., Arslan, C., & Bakla, A. (2014). An investigation into foreign language learning anxiety, stress and personality in higher education. *International Journal on New Trends in Education and their Implications (IJONTE)*, 5(2), 199-208.
- Kondo, D. S., & Ying-Ling, Y. (2004). Strategies for coping with language anxiety: The case of students of English in Japan. *Elt Journal*, 58(3), 258-265. DOI: 10.1093/elt/58.3.258
- Krashen, S. (1982). Principles and practice in second language acquisition. DOI: 10.2307/3586656
- Lian, L.H., & Budin, M.B. (2014). Investigating the relationship between English language anxiety and the achievement of school based oral English test among Malaysian form four students. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 2(1), pp. 67-79
- Liu, M. (2006). Anxiety in Chinese EFL students at different proficiency levels. *System*, 34(3), 301-316. DOI: 10.1016/j.system.2006.04.004
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1989). Anxiety and second-language learning: Toward a theoretical clarification. *Language learning*, 39(2), 251-275. DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-1770.1989.tb00423.x
- MacIntyre, P. D., Clément, R., Dörnyei, Z., & Noels, K. A. (1998). Conceptualizing willingness to communicate in a L2: A situational model of L2 confidence and affiliation. *The Modern Language Journal*, 82(4), 545-562. DOI: 10.1111/j.1540-4781.1998.tb05543.x

- Marzec-Stawiarska, M. (2015). Investigating foreign language speaking anxiety among advanced learners of English. In *Issues in teaching, learning and testing speaking in a second language* (pp. 103-119). Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg. DOI: 10.1007/978-3-642-38339-7_7
- Mede, E., & Kararımak, Ö. (2017). The predictor roles of speaking anxiety and English self efficacy on foreign language speaking anxiety. *Journal of Teacher Education and Educators*, 6(1), 117-131.
- Melouah, A. (2013). Foreign Language Anxiety in EFL Speaking Classrooms: A Case Study of First-year LMD Students of English at Saad Dahlab University of Blida, Algeria. *Arab World English Journal*, 4(1).
- Miskam, N.N., & Saidalvi, A. (2018). Investigating English Language Speaking Anxiety among Malaysian Undergraduate Learners. *Asian Social Science*. 15. 1. DOI: 10.5539/ass.v15n1p1
- Mohamad, A. & Wahid, N. (2009). Anxiety and speaking English as a second among male and female business students in university industry Selangor. *Segi Review*, 2(2), 65- 84
- Mulyono, H., Ferawati, F., Sari, R. N., & Ningsih, S. K. (2019). Factors Contributing to EFL Students' Speaking Anxiety. *Register Journal*, 12(1), 13-27. DOI: 10.18326/RGT.V12I1.13-27
- Öztürk, E. Ö., & Ok, S. (2014). Motivational behaviors of teachers in Turkish EFL classes: Perception of students. *DilveDilbilimiÇalışmalarıDergisi*, 10(2). DOI: 10.17263/JLLS.56999
- Öztürk, G., & Gürbüz, N. (2013). The impact of gender on foreign language speaking anxiety and motivation. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 70, 654-665. DOI: 10.1016/J.SBSPRO.2013.01.106
- Öztürk, G., & Gürbüz, N. (2014). Speaking anxiety among Turkish EFL learners: The case at a state university. *DilveDilbilimiÇalışmalarıDergisi*, 10(1), 1-17. DOI: 10.17263/JLLS.13933
- Rafada, S.H., & Madini, A.A. (2017). Major Causes of Saudi Learners' Speaking Anxiety in EFL Classrooms. *International Journal of English Language Education*. 5. 54-71. 10.5296/ijelev.v5i1.10645. DOI: 10.5296/ijelev.v5i1.10645
- Rasekh, A. E., Shomoossi, N., & Soleimani, M. (2009). Code-switching as a new strategy: Speak English to overcome your shyness. *Iranian Journal of Language Studies*, 3(2).
- Riasati, M. J. (2011). Language learning anxiety from EFL learners' perspective. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 7(6), 907-914.
- Sadighi, F., & Dastpak, M. (2017). The sources of foreign language speaking anxiety of Iranian English language learners. *International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies*, 5(4), 111-115. DOI: 10.7575/AIAC.IJELS.V.5N.4P.111
- Satar, H. M., & Özdener, N. (2008). The effects of synchronous CMC on speaking proficiency and anxiety: Text versus voice chat. *The Modern Language Journal*, 92(4), 595-613. DOI: 10.1111/J.1540-4781.2008.00789.X
- Sayuri, S. (2016). English speaking problems of EFL learners of Mulawarman University. *Indonesian Journal of EFL and Linguistics*, 1(1), 47-61. DOI: 10.21462/ijefll.v1i1.4
- Şenel, M. (2012). Oral communication anxiety and problems of Turkish EFL learners at Samsun 19 Mayıs University, ELT Department. *Frontiers of Language and Teaching*, 3, 49-58.
- Sharifi, F. & Lashkarian, A. (2015). Relationship between Anxiety and Speaking Ability of EFL Learners. *Journal of Applied Linguistics*. 1(3); 31-41.
- Sparks, R. L., & Ganschow, L. (1991). Foreign language learning differences: Affective or native language aptitude differences?. *The modern language journal*, 75(1), 3-16. DOI: 10.1111/J.1540-4781.1991.TB01076.X
- Subasi, G. (2010). What are the Main Sources of Turkish EFL Students' Anxiety in Oral Practice?. *Online Submission*, 1(2), 29-49. DOI: 10.17569/TOJQI.29608

- Sutarsyah, C. (2017). An analysis of student's speaking anxiety and its effect on speaking performance. *IJELTAL (Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics)*, 1(2), 143-152. DOI: 10.21093/IJELTAL.V1I2.14
- TakkaçTulgar, A. (2018). Speaking Anxiety of Foreign Learners of Turkish in Target Context. *International Online Journal of Education and Teaching*. 5.
- Tanveer, M. (2007). Investigation of the factors that cause language anxiety for ESL/EFL learners in learning speaking skills and the influence it casts on communication in the target language. University of Glasgow, Scotland. DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.1.1995.1129
- Tarihoran, N. (2016). Understanding speaking anxiety in efl classroom. *Siliwangi International English Conference 2016*.
- Tercan, G., & Dikilitaş, K. (2015). EFL students' speaking anxiety: a case from tertiary level students. *ELT Research Journal*, 4(1), 16-27.
- Tien, C. Y. (2018). English speaking anxiety in EFL university classrooms in Taiwan. *European Journal of English Language Teaching*. DOI: 10.46827/EJEL.VoIo.2041
- Toghraee, T., & Shahrokhi, M. (2014). Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety and Learners' and Teachers' Beliefs toward FLL: A Case Study of Iranian Undergraduate EFL Learners. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature*, 3(2). DOI: 10.7575/AIAC.IJALEL.V.3N.2P.131
- Tok, H. (2009). Efllearners' communication obstacles. *Electronic Journal of Social Sciences*, 8(29). DOI: 10.17755/ESOSDER.87182
- Tokoz-Göktepe, F. (2014). Speaking problems of 9 (th) grade high school Turkish learners of L2 English and possible reasons for those problems: Exploring the teachers and students' perspectives. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 116:1875-1879. DOI: 10.1016/J.SBSPRO.2014.01.487
- Tridinanti, G. (2018). The Correlation between Speaking Anxiety, Self-Confidence, and Speaking Achievement of Undergraduate EFL Students of Private University in Palembang. *International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies*, 6(4), 35-39. DOI: 10.7575/AIAC.IJELS.V.6N.4P.35
- Tuncer, M., & Doğan, Y. (2015). Effect of foreign language classroom anxiety on Turkish university students' academic achievement in foreign language learning. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 3(6), 14-19. DOI: 10.11114/JETS.V3I6.998
- Wilang, J. D., & Singhasiri, W. (2017). Out-of-class anxiety in a non-English speaking context and its effects on intelligibility and comprehensibility. *Issues in Educational Research*, 27(3), 620.
- Wilson, J. T. S. (2006). Anxiety in Learning English as a Foreign Language: Its Associations with Student Variables, with Overall Proficiency, and with Performance on an Oral Test: Thesis Doctoral. Editorial de la Universidad de Granada.
- Woodrow, Lindy. (2006). Anxiety and Speaking English as a Second Language. *RELC Journal*. 37. 308-328. DOI: 10.1177/0033688206071315
- Yalçın, Ö., & İnceçay, V. (2014). Foreign language speaking anxiety: The case of spontaneous speaking activities. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 116, 2620-2624. DOI: 10.1016/J.SBSPRO.2014.01.623
- Yaman, I. (2016). What if There Is Nobody Around to Speak English? Then Keep Your Voice Diary. *English Language Teaching*, 9(3), 160-166. DOI: 10.5539/ELT.V9N3P160
- Yayli, D. (2012). University summer school students' foreign language anxiety levels. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 46, 1401-1405. DOI:10.1016/J.SBSPRO.2012.05.310
- Young, D. J. (1991). Creating a low-anxiety classroom environment: What does language anxiety research suggest?. *The modern language journal*, 75(4), 426-437. DOI: 10.1111/J.1540-4781.1991.TB05378.X
- Yüce, E. (2018). An Investigation into the Relationship between EFL Learners' Foreign Music Listening Habits and Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety. *Online Submission*, 6(2), 471-482. DOI: 10.18298/IJLET.3041